

Care For Your Area Services – Efficiency, Improvement and Transformation Review.

Care for Your Area is an umbrella organisation that provides a large number of different front line services. The scope of this review is to consider the following services: Refuse Collection, Street Cleansing, Horticultural Services, Urban Parks, Recycling Services, Markets, Public Conveniences and Workshops and Vehicle Maintenance. This review will consider each of these separate services in turn. Other services that fall within CFYA that are subject to previous and ongoing reviews include Commercial Waste Services, Highway Maintenance, Countryside Parks, Bulky Household Waste.

GREEN WASTE RECYCLING COLLECTION

Service Baseline / Initial Challenge	Guidance	Information
Description of Current Service	Who provides the service?	<p>This service is provided through an in-house service provision by Care For Your Area based at Cowpen Lane Depot, Billingham.</p> <p>The Green Waste recycling collection service operates on a fortnightly basis from April to October 26 weeks collection to every household with a garden - around 70,000 properties.</p> <p>Every household across the borough with a garden is issued with a Green reusable hessian sack for recycling their garden waste.</p> <p>Residents can purchase additional hessian sacks at £1.50 or if they chose they can recycle their garden waste using clear plastic sacks – rolls of 26 can be purchased at a cost of £2.00 per roll.</p> <p>There are currently up to nine HGV refuse vehicles used to provide the service, each</p>

		<p>having one driver and two loaders.</p> <p>One separate, driver only, vehicle provides the recycling service to farms, this vehicle also collects Blue box and bag recycling (glass, tins, batteries and paper), Plastic & Cardboard as well as green waste that is sorted into separate containers on the vehicle during collection.</p>
Baseline	History - how was the service formed and why does it exist?	<p>Only a few years ago, Stockton's waste services were limited, with traditional refuse collection arrangements only, until 2002. With the increasing emphasis on the effects of the waste stream on the environment the government introduced targets for recycling waste.</p> <p>In depth Scrutiny reviews from 2004 onward led to the introduction of a trial of separate green waste collections followed by borough wide collections in 2005, now every household in the borough with a garden around 70,000 properties in total can benefit from the service.</p> <p>As part of further Scrutiny work, a no side waste and one wheelie bin policy was adopted with the introduction of Borough wide collections of plastic & cardboard being successfully rolled out from 2009.</p>
Challenge	What influences impact on the service? (political, social economical, technological)	<p>Due to a number of key national and local developments including the publication of the Waste Strategy for England and the development of the Tees Valley Joint Waste Management Strategy, the management of Household Waste has become more of a</p>

		<p>priority within Local Authorities. The government previously introduced targets for Council's to divert waste into recycling with strict targets imposed, although the percentage recycling targets are no longer in existence from 2011 with the demise of the audit commission many authorities are retaining the recycling targets as a way to divert waste from landfill. (National Indicators 191,192 and 193 are still being retained on the single data list).</p> <p>Stockton is fortunate to have Energy from Waste Plant on its doorstep and therefore the majority of waste is disposed of at the EFW site, although with National focus upon Environmental issues residents are becoming far more Environmentally astute, therefore the increase and demand for recycling provision continues to be a priority.</p> <p>The Council now operates a multi-material Borough wide recycling service and this has reduced the amount of waste in the domestic waste stream – refuse rounds have been reduced to reflect these lower tonnages.</p> <p>As recycling technologies (e.g. food waste, green waste) advance, further reductions in the domestic waste stream are possible with a move to more recycling.</p>
--	--	--

	<p>How does the service perform?</p>	<p>Stockton's recycling collection service which is part of the wider CFYA services is recognised as being one of the country's top performing services.</p> <p>Currently 10.06% of the waste stream is being collected by Green Waste recycling. Customer Satisfaction ratings for recycling in 2010/11 is 93.08%</p> <p>The latest MORI poll results in 2008 showed 87% satisfaction with recycling services within Stockton.</p>
	<p>What does inspection tell us about this service?</p>	<p>Previous Best Value inspections by the Audit Commission have given the service the highest possible 3*** service awards.</p>
	<p>What resources are used?</p>	<p>As the Green Waste Service is operated on a seasonal basis from April to October a seasonal workforce is used to deliver the service, with one driver and two loaders required on each vehicle. The number of rounds can fluctuate between nine and five rounds, depending on tonnages collected.</p> <p>The volume of tonnage collected is influenced by external factors such as the month, weather and participation levels. A Flexible, in-house service allows the team to deal with such operational fluctuations within allocated budgets and without the needs for any contract variations or additional charges to the Council. Vehicles and labour not utilised on Green Waste during periods of reduced tonnages can be utilised elsewhere within CFYA, such as street cleansing.</p>

		<p>In addition to the assets listed below, there are a range of other resources used including buildings and services used at Cowpen Depot and Yarm Road and a variety of specialist equipment.</p>
	<p>What assets are used to deliver the current service?</p>	<p>Waste vehicles are the single most valuable asset the service uses. Up to nine HGV open back compaction vehicles owned by the authority are used to run the service; a depreciation fund is paid annually to enable the authority to purchase new vehicles at the end of the lifespan of the vehicles. All vehicle purchases are subject to regular and rigorous procurement exercises, that ensure best value is delivered at all times.</p> <p>Every Household eligible for the service is issued with a hessian green reusable sack for garden waste, although clear white plastic sacks can also be used – the authority issue around 12,000 rolls of clear green waste bags each year at a charge of £2.00 per roll.</p>
	<p>Are there any limitations or barriers affecting the delivery of the service?</p>	<p>Stockton provides a weekly domestic refuse collection service to all households across the borough and there is no means to make recycling compulsory, this means that residents are only ‘encouraged’ to recycle and where households choose not to recycle their household waste is collected by means of traditional domestic refuse collections, this has a number of impacts:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There is a limit on the amount of waste that is recycled and where waste is collected by traditional domestic refuse

		<p>collections there is a risk that the waste could at times be diverted to Landfill – (Landfill sites incur additional travelling times and distances, increasing fuel consumption and costs).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The cost of disposing Green Waste at EFW is £38.04 (£18 disposal cost for green waste) – a difference of £20.04 per tonne – based on average of up to 6,000 tonne per year could result in increased disposal costs of around £120,000. • The cost of disposing Green Waste at Landfill is £77.51 - a difference of £59.51 per tonne – based on average of up to 6,000 tonne per year could result in increased disposal costs of around £350,000. • The service currently operates 26 weeks of the year and therefore some garden wastes generated outside of the 26 week collection period may end up at landfill or EFW.
	<p>If the service is outsourced or provided by a third party, how are service standards monitored?</p>	<p>Service standards could in theory be monitored by means of the Client (i.e. SBC) insisting upon certain performance standards that the Contractor must abide by. In reality and the experience of waste services that were outsourced until recently, there is little the Client can do to control performance delivered by a wholly separate organisation, other than through formal proceedings, which are time consuming, costly and don't provide the customer with the immediate service improvements required.</p>

	<p>Could the service be provided through a different mechanism?</p>	<p>Some European countries only provide communal waste containers as opposed to doorstep collections, although there would need to be an increase in bring site facilities across the borough, as Garden Waste can be bulky there would be a limit on how much the bring sites could hold meaning increased risk of side/combustible waste on the streets – there would need to be consideration to an increased frequency of collection.</p> <p>Compost Bins could be encouraged more widely although a full education and support programme would need to be provided – this scheme would not be suitable for all households as garden waste needs to be mixed with other materials to produce the compost – households with large gardens would also need to consider additional methods.</p> <p>In reality, the current arrangements, whilst not perfect, are the most practicable means of providing the service.</p>
<p>Customer Baseline</p>	<p>Who are the customers what are their needs now?</p>	<p>There are around 70,000 households with a garden in the Borough and this figure is growing each year, which does place pressure on the service as are no increases in base budgets to allow for property growth.</p> <p>There is a statutory requirement to collect waste and resident expectations have increased with the recent emphasis on Environmental impact the expectation is for additional materials to be collected and for the expansion of recycling provision. Green</p>

	<p>How are service users consulted and how do their views shape delivery?</p> <p>How do you communicate with your users?</p>	<p>Waste is one of the most popular recycling services as it provides no additional inconvenience for residents who bag the grass once it is cut. There is currently no limitation on the number of garden waste bags collected per household, therefore every household irrespective of it's size receives the same level of service.</p> <p>Residents are consulted on a regular basis using a variety of methods, such as Ipsos Mori surveys, telephone satisfaction survey's, attendance at Resident Association meetings and from Elected Members. Regular information is provided in Stockton News, press releases and the Internet on collection schedules and other important issues.</p> <p>Recent Ipsos Mori satisfaction survey results demonstrate that the service has a customer satisfaction rating of 87%.</p> <p>Communication through resident meetings, walk the wards, and using the Council's view point is all face to face. There is also an annual leaflet and calendar delivered to every household in the borough as well as regular Stockton News and local press articles. In 2010 the funding for the recycling/waste communications team was removed as a specific means of communication, although the service links in with local events to provide local educational visits and attendance at local shows and events.</p>
--	--	--

	<p>How are these services promoted / marketed?</p> <p>What do Viewpoint Surveys/ internal audit reports tell us about the service?</p>	<p>Again with annual leaflets being distributed to all households in the borough informing them of collection arrangements, through local media and also on advertising on the council's fleet vehicles. In 2009 promotional material was established on Stockton's 'recycling revolution' and the development of a recycling website www.recycleforstockton.gov.uk. Internal and viewpoint surveys have shown an average satisfaction rating of 93.08% and viewpoint members have been actively involved in the expansion of recycling services, from collection methods to the containers we use. The most recent audit of the refuse and recycling service was carried out in March 2011 where the Service was given Substantial Assurance overall.</p> <p>In 2007 a survey carried out showed that 88% of residents asked used the Green waste Recycling Service.</p>
<p>Customer Challenge</p>	<p>Are there customers who could use the service but don't?</p>	<p>The majority of residents do use the fortnightly recycling collection service provided, though recent research suggests 30% of residents place their recycling out for collection through their own choice less frequently, such as monthly. A contributing factor in this is the ease, choice and reliability of the Council's recycling services and also that residents can still place waste into their wheelie bin for weekly collection. Also fluctuations in weather and times of the year (such as public holidays) have an effect on set out rates – for example there is an increase following bank holidays when we have a spell of good weather.</p>

	<p>Are there customers using the service who shouldn't be?</p> <p>Who are the customers of the future and what are their needs?</p> <p>What is likely to impact on demand for these services in the future?</p> <p>What do complaints/ compliments tell you about these services?</p>	<p>No the Green Waste recycling service is available to all households with a garden across the borough – where there are communal areas (such as flats/sheltered housing schemes) they garden waste is disposed of as part of the contract grass cutting. Residents who pay for a company to cut the grass also pay a charge to the company for disposal.</p> <p>Residents of new households in the borough will require access to the recycling facilities, therefore working with planners and architects allows waste and recycling collection issues to be addressed during development design stages.</p> <p>With increasing demand and environmental awareness of residents the trend over the past couple of years has been that more residents actively and regularly participate in recycling. With the increase in households and the environmental awareness of residents the increase in recycling participation is expected to increase.</p> <p>Feedback from our customers demonstrates this service is highly valued by residents.</p>
<p>Aims & Objectives Baseline</p>	<p>Is the service required by statute?</p>	<p>Refuse collection is currently a statutory function, and although recycling is not statutory with the global effects on the waste stream and issues around landfill Council's have been under pressure to divert waste and encourage recycling with residents.</p>

<p>Challenge</p>	<p>Is there a statutory level of service?</p> <p>Is the service responsive or proactive or a mixture?</p> <p>Is the service needed?</p> <p>What would happen if the service was not provided either in whole or part?</p> <p>How would the service react to new pressures? What capacity would be required to deal with additional / new demands?</p>	<p>There is no statutory level of service, i.e weekly, fortnightly, monthly etc.</p> <p>The service is proactive as a scheduled collection service is carried out with all residents being aware of their collection day; a responsive service also exists to collect any missed bags – even when residents have failed to place them out for collection.</p> <p>The service needs to be provided in some shape or form as there is a statutory requirement to collect waste.</p> <p>Waste that was not collected through kerbside recycling would go back into the waste stream and would still need to be collected – this would mean that the current domestic refuse collection service would need to be expanded to take the additional waste. This waste would therefore go to EFW or landfill rather than being recycled – the impact would be that side waste would need to be collected and restrictions of one wheelie bin per property would need to be reviewed. The additional waste in domestic collections would incur a cost for disposal and an increase in refuse collection vehicles.</p> <p>The service is flexible enough to meet additional property growth and to adapt to any technological advances within the waste industry.</p>
<p>Aims & Objectives Challenge</p>	<p>Who provides a similar service to this using a different delivery mechanism e.g. external</p>	<p>The service can either be delivered through an in-house provision or through an</p>

	partnerships, shared services etc?	outsourced private contractor, shared services with other local authorities could also be considered. Some LA's do use external providers, although when comparing satisfaction and performance with other Local Authorities in the Tees Valley who use external contract provision. The in house service provided by Stockton performs way above that of an external provider.
Relevance / Context Baseline / Challenge	<p>How does the service fit with the overall aims of the Council?</p> <p>How does the service contribute to key policy areas?</p> <p>What policies, plans and strategies impact on the service e.g. statutory, policy, function, other services?</p> <p>Are there any political judgements / decisions involved in determining the level of service?</p>	<p>The service contributes to both the Sustainable Community Strategy & Council Plan, notably through the following policy area:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Make the Borough a cleaner, greener and more attractive environment. <p>As refuse collection is a statutory function this has an impact on the service in line with the Waste Strategy for England and the Tees Valley Joint Waste Management Strategy</p> <p>As the Service is available to every household in the borough with a garden the service is extremely high profile and politically sensitive. Reconfiguration of the service has always been determined via scrutiny review/cabinet approval. The Service also comes under the cabinet member for Environment.</p>
Financial / Resource Considerations Baseline	What are the costs of the service?	<p>The Green Waste recycling collection budget for 2011/12 is £368,043 the main costs are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Salaries £161,942 • Transport costs £164,030 (of which £56,070 is due to fuel). • Supplies & Services £47,071.

	<p>Capital and revenue costs?</p> <p>What is the level of 3rd party expenditure?</p> <p>What contracts or other arrangements are in place (spend analysis)?</p> <p>What is the Councils commitment to contracts / other arrangements?</p> <p>Do you have any charging policies?</p> <p>How have Gershon efficiency savings impacted on the service and how were the service planning to meet future Gershon efficiency targets?</p>	<p>The service receives £33,000 worth of income through the sale of plastic bags.</p> <p>All revenue costs</p> <p>N/A</p> <p>A contract currently exists with Thompson's recycling for disposal of green waste material (£18 per tonne) – the Garden/Green waste is tipped at Thompsons and recycled as soil improver.</p> <p>The council is currently in a year on year contract and negotiating a 3 year contract tender.</p> <p>There is no charge currently to households for Green Waste recycling collections. Replacement and additional recycling receptacles are currently charged at £1.50 for a green hessian sack or £2.00 for a roll of 26 clear bags.</p> <p>The greatest risk to the financial stability of the service are those issues that are beyond any control – rising fuel costs, although the plans to look at continual configuration of the rounds for efficiencies as well as continuing with multi-skilled workforce would initiate Gershon Savings as well as increases in income from sale of materials. The move from free clear disposable green waste sacks in</p>
--	--	---

	How will the current financial climate affect the service?	<p>2009 to a reusable hessian green waste bag in 2010 and 2011 offered further Gershon savings.</p> <p>As the Service operates free of charge there is no expected impact on the Service although more customers could use the reusable sack and therefore a reduction in income from sales could be anticipated.</p>
Financial / Resource Considerations Challenge	<p>How can you demonstrate that the service is cost effective overall?</p> <p>Do external contracts offer value for money?</p>	<p>Our current performance on recycling collections (including all recycling) is £24.17 cost per household – the average is £22.91 with other local authorities, however this is not directly comparable as other LA's do not offer the full range – this figure was reported as at 09/10 financial year and with the increase in income the cost is expected to reduce.</p> <p>All external supplies and equipment are subject to ongoing and regular procurement exercises. A current tender exercise is also being carried out for sale of recyclables.</p>
Service Drivers	<p>What do we need to change and why?</p> <p>What are the main drivers of change?</p>	<p>The service needs to ensure that collections are as efficient as possible. This means reviewing collection days, ensuring collection routes are well-organised and that the workforce is well trained and motivated.</p> <p>Efficiencies can be made through regular round configuration and ensuring disposal arrangements are procured effectively.</p> <p>To ensure the service runs efficiently and residents get VFM</p>